N -level atom and ( $\mathrm{N}-1$ ) modes: an exactly solvable model with detuning and multiphotons

This article has been downloaded from IOPscience. Please scroll down to see the full text article.
1987 J. Phys. A: Math. Gen. 20 L359
(http://iopscience.iop.org/0305-4470/20/6/004)
View the table of contents for this issue, or go to the journal homepage for more

Download details:
IP Address: 129.252.86.83
The article was downloaded on 01/06/2010 at 05:26

Please note that terms and conditions apply.

## LETTER TO THE EDITOR

# $N$-level atom and ( $N-1$ ) modes: an exactly solvable model with detuning and multiphotons 

A M Abdel-Hafez $\dagger$, A-S F Obada $\ddagger \S$ and M M A Ahmad $\ddagger$<br>$\dagger$ Junior Faculty and Mathematics and Science Centre, Taif, Saudi Arabia<br>$\ddagger$ Faculty of Science, Al-Azhar University, Nasr City, Cairo, Egypt

Received 16 January 1987


#### Abstract

A model is presented for the interaction between an $N$-level atom and ( $N-1$ ) modes. Under the exact resonance condition between the modes with a detuning parameter, the Hamiltonian becomes solvable. The evolution operator is calculated and then the time development for the photon number operators and the occupation numbers are obtained. Multiphoton processes are discussed.


The interaction between electromagnetic fields and atoms lies at the heart of laser theory [ 1,2 ], quantum optics $[3,4]$ some non-linear phenomena $[5,6]$ and laser spectroscopy [7,8]. Some models have been presented to discuss different phenomena. The Jaynes-Cummings model [9] for the two-level atom has been investigated extensively to study emission, saturated absorption, the dynamic Stark effect [see 4, 8-11] and collapses and revivals [12-17].

The three-level atom model has been introduced to study stepwise and two-photon excitations [11, 18, 19], coherence trapping [20,21] and two-photon lasers [22, 23]. The semiclassical treatment of the problem has also been given [20, 22, 23]. Recently the problem has been discussed in a full quantum mechanical manner to discuss dynamics of the system and collapses and revivals [14, 24-27]. The multilevel atom has been considered to treat the Dicke model [28] for a system of two-level atoms in interaction with radiation [3,5]. It has been used recently to discuss multimode lasers [29].

In this letter we present a model for the interaction between a $N$-level atom and $(N-1)$ modes of radiation. This model includes a detuning parameter $\Delta$ and functions of the photon numbers in the modes. By specifying these functions we are capable of discussing multiphoton processes.

We assume an atom with $N$ levels of energies $\omega_{1}>\omega_{2}>\cdots>\omega_{N}$ interacts with ( $N-1$ ) modes whose energies are $\left\{\Omega_{i}\right\}, i=1,2, \ldots N-1$. Each mode connects one of the lower energy levels to the upper level as in the scheme shown in figure 1.

According to this, the Hamiltonian of the system is written as follows in the rotating wave approximation [4]:
$H=\sum_{i=1}^{N} \omega_{i} \hat{S}_{i i}+\sum_{i=1}^{N-1} \Omega_{i} \hat{a}_{i}^{+} \hat{a}_{i}+\sum_{i=1}^{N-1} \lambda_{i}\left(\hat{S}_{1, i+1} \hat{R}_{i}+\hat{R}_{i}^{+} \hat{S}_{i+1,1}\right)$
where $\hat{S}_{i j}$ are the generators of the $\mathrm{U}(N)$ group [29] and $\hat{R}_{i}$ is given by

$$
\begin{equation*}
\hat{R}_{i}=\hat{a}_{i} f_{i}\left(\left\{\hat{n}_{i}\right\}\right) \tag{2}
\end{equation*}
$$

§ Present address: Faculty of Education, Umm Al-Qura University, Taif, Saudi Arabia.


Figure 1. Schematic representation of the interaction between an $N$-level atom and ( $N-1$ ) modes.

The operator $\hat{a}_{i}\left(\hat{a}_{i}^{+}\right)$is the annihilation (creation) boson operator for a photon in the field mode (i), $f_{i}\left(\left\{\hat{n}_{i}\right\}\right)$ is a real function of the photons numbers in the modes and $\hat{n}_{i}=a_{i}^{+} a_{i}$ is the number operator in the mode $i$. By specifying these functions later we will be able to discuss multiphoton processes. Finally $\left\{\lambda_{i}\right\}$ is the set of coupling constants between the atom and the modes.

We assume that $\hat{S}_{i j}$ and $\hat{R}_{k}$ commute, while we find the following commutation relations

$$
\begin{align*}
& {\left[\hat{R}_{j}, \hat{n}_{k}\right]=\hat{R}_{j} \delta_{j k} \quad\left[\hat{R}_{j}^{+}, \hat{n}_{k}\right]=-\hat{R}_{j}^{+} \delta_{j k}} \\
& {\left[\hat{S}_{i j}, \hat{S}_{k l}\right]=\hat{S}_{i l} \delta_{j k}-\hat{S}_{k j} \delta_{i} .} \tag{3}
\end{align*}
$$

When we restrict the number $N$ to 3 and put $f_{i}\left\{n_{i}\right\}=$ constant we get all models that have been discussed before for the three-level atom in the ' $\Lambda$ ' configuration [14, 24-27]. Singh's model [16] for the two-level atom with intensity assisted transition is obtained when one substitutes $N=2, f_{i}=f(n)=\sqrt{n}$. Of course, one obtains the standard Jaynes-Cummings model [9], when one further puts $f(n)=$ constant. The model for the $N$-level atom of Li and Zhu [29] follows from (1) when one takes $f_{i}=$ constant and $\Delta=0$.

Using the commutation relations (3) we find the following operators:

$$
\begin{equation*}
\hat{N}_{j}=\hat{a}_{j}^{+} \hat{a}_{j}-\hat{S}_{j+1, j+1} \quad j=1,2, \ldots,(N-1) \tag{4}
\end{equation*}
$$

to be constants of motion. This means that the difference between the photon number in the $j$ th mode and the occupation number in the energy level $\omega_{j+1}$ is constant.

When we further use the condition

$$
\begin{equation*}
\omega_{1}-\omega_{j+1}-\Omega_{j}=\Delta . \tag{5}
\end{equation*}
$$

which is the resonance condition for the ( $N-1$ ) modes, the model becomes exactly solvable and the Hamiltonian (1) breaks up into the following:

$$
\begin{equation*}
\hat{H}=\hat{D}+\hat{C} \tag{6}
\end{equation*}
$$

where the two operators

$$
\begin{equation*}
\hat{D}=\left(\omega_{1}-\Delta\right) I+\sum_{j=1}^{N-1} \Omega_{j} \hat{N}_{j} \tag{6a}
\end{equation*}
$$

and

$$
\begin{equation*}
\hat{C}=\Delta \hat{S}_{11}+\sum_{j=1}^{N-1} \lambda_{j}\left(\hat{S}_{1, j+1} \hat{R}_{j}^{+}+\hat{R}_{j} \hat{S}_{j+1,1}\right) \tag{6b}
\end{equation*}
$$

commute, and hence are constants of motion.
We look now for the time evolution operator $\hat{U}(t)$ defined by

$$
\begin{equation*}
\hat{U}(t)=\exp (-\mathrm{i} \hat{H} t)=\exp (-\mathrm{i} \hat{D} t) \exp (-\mathrm{i} \hat{C} t) \tag{7}
\end{equation*}
$$

This form is due to the commutation of $\hat{D}$ and $\hat{C}$. The term $\exp (-\mathrm{i} \hat{D} t)$ introduces phase factors that would not affect the expectation values calculated later. The operator $\exp (-\mathrm{i} \hat{C} t)$ is written in the following matrix form:

$$
\exp (-\mathrm{i} \hat{C} t)=\exp \left(-\frac{1}{2} \mathrm{i} \Delta t\right)\left[\begin{array}{cc}
\hat{B}^{(0)} & \hat{B}^{(1)}  \tag{8}\\
-\hat{B}^{(1)+} & \hat{B}^{(2)}
\end{array}\right]
$$

where $\hat{B}^{(0)}$ is the single-element matrix

$$
\begin{equation*}
\left\{\hat{b}_{11}^{(0)}=\cos (\hat{\mu} t)-\frac{\mathrm{i}}{2 \mu} \sin (\hat{\mu} t)\right\} \tag{8a}
\end{equation*}
$$

$\hat{B}^{(1)}$ is the single-row matrix

$$
\begin{equation*}
\left\{\hat{b}_{1 j}^{(\mathrm{t})}=-\mathrm{i} \sin (\hat{\mu} t) \lambda_{j} \hat{R}_{j}\right\} \quad j \in\{1, \ldots N-1\} \tag{8b}
\end{equation*}
$$

and $\hat{B}^{(1)}$ its Hermitian conjugate, while $\hat{B}^{(2)}$ is the $(N-1) \times(N-1)$ square matrix

$$
\begin{equation*}
\left\{\hat{b}_{i j}^{(2)}=\exp \left(\frac{1}{2} \mathrm{i} \Delta t\right) \delta_{i j}+\lambda_{i} \hat{R}_{i}^{+} \hat{A} \lambda_{j} \hat{R}_{j}\right\} \quad i, j \in\{1, \ldots N-1\} \tag{8c}
\end{equation*}
$$

the $\hat{\nu}, \hat{\mu}$ and $\hat{A}$ operators are given by:

$$
\begin{align*}
& \nu=\sum_{j=1}^{N-1} \lambda_{j} \hat{R}_{j} \hat{R}_{j}^{+}=\sum_{j=1}^{N-1} \lambda_{j}^{2}\left(\hat{n}_{j}+1\right) f_{j}^{2}\left(\hat{n}_{1}, \ldots, \hat{n}_{j}+1, \ldots, \hat{n}_{N-1}\right)  \tag{9a}\\
& \hat{\mu}^{2}=\hat{\nu}+\Delta^{2} / 4 \quad \hat{A}=\left\{\cos (\hat{\mu} t)-\exp \left(\frac{1}{2} \mathrm{i} \Delta t\right)+\frac{\mathrm{i} \Delta}{2 \mu} \sin (\hat{\mu} t)\right\} \hat{\nu}^{-1} . \tag{9b}
\end{align*}
$$

They satisfy

$$
\hat{a}_{j}^{+} \hat{v}=\hat{\nu}_{j} \hat{a}_{j}^{+}
$$

where

$$
\begin{equation*}
\hat{\nu}_{j}=\lambda_{j}^{2} \hat{n}_{j} f_{j}^{2}\left(\left\{\hat{n}_{i}\right\}\right)+\sum_{\substack{(k \neq j) \\ k=1}} \lambda_{k}^{2}\left(\hat{n}_{k}+1\right) f_{k}^{2}\left(\hat{n}_{1}, \ldots, \hat{n}_{j}-1, \hat{n}_{k}+1, \ldots, \hat{n}_{N-1}\right) . \tag{9c}
\end{equation*}
$$

the following operators are defined:

$$
\begin{equation*}
\hat{\mu}_{j}^{2}=\hat{\nu}_{j}+\Delta^{2} / 4 \quad \hat{A}_{j}=\left\{\cos \left(\hat{\mu}_{j} t\right)-\exp \left(\frac{1}{2} \mathrm{i} \Delta t\right)+\frac{\mathrm{i} \Delta}{2 \mu_{j}} \sin \left(\hat{\mu}_{j} t\right)\right\} \hat{v}_{j}^{-1} \tag{9d}
\end{equation*}
$$

When we take $\Delta=0$ and $f_{j}=1$, we get the results of [29].
The quantities $\hat{\mu}$ and $\hat{\mu}_{j}$ are Rabi frequencies in this case. They are direct generalisations to Rabi frequencies in the two- and three-level atom systems [9, 14-16, 24-27].

Once the operator $\hat{U}(t)$ is calculated, we can compute the time development for any operator $\hat{O}$ through the equation

$$
\begin{equation*}
\hat{O}(t)=\hat{U}(t) \hat{O} \hat{U}^{+}(t) . \tag{10}
\end{equation*}
$$

One of the quantities on which we shall concentrate is the probability distribution function $P\left(\left\{n_{j}\right\}, t\right)$ of finding $n_{i}$ photons in the $j$ th mode, which is defined as follows:

$$
\begin{equation*}
P\left(\left\{n_{j}\right\}, t\right)=\left\langle\left\{n_{j}\right\}\right| \operatorname{Tr}_{A} \hat{U}(t) \hat{\rho}(0) \hat{U}^{+}(t)\left|\left\{n_{j}\right\}\right\rangle . \tag{11}
\end{equation*}
$$

The trace over the atomic states of the density matrix operator $\hat{\rho}$ of the system gives the density matrix operator for the fields $\hat{\rho}_{F}$.

We consider in what follows the system to be initially in one of its pure states.
(a) Atom is initially in one of its states of energy $\omega_{k+1}(k \neq 0)$. The initial density matrix operator is given by

$$
\begin{equation*}
\rho^{k}(0)=\rho_{F}(0) \otimes \hat{S}_{k+1, k+1} \tag{12a}
\end{equation*}
$$

The distribution function takes the form

$$
\begin{align*}
P_{\Delta}^{k}\left(\left\{n_{i}\right\}, t\right)= & \lambda_{k}^{2}\left(n_{k}+1\right) f_{k}^{2}\left(n_{1}, \ldots, n_{k}+1, \ldots, n_{N-1}\right) \frac{\sin ^{2}(\mu t)}{\mu^{2}} \\
& \times P\left(n_{1}, \ldots, n_{k}+1, \ldots, n_{N-1}\right)+\left|\exp \left(\frac{1}{2} \mathrm{i} \Delta t\right)+A_{k} \lambda_{k}^{2} n_{k} f_{k}^{2}\left(\left\{n_{i}\right\}\right)\right|^{2} P\left(\left\{n_{i}\right\}\right) \\
& +\sum_{j \neq k} \lambda_{k}^{2}\left(n_{k}+1\right) f_{k}^{2}\left(n_{1}, \ldots, n_{j}-1, \ldots, n_{k}+1, \ldots, n_{N-1}\right) \lambda_{j}^{2} n_{j} \\
& \times f_{j}^{2}\left(\left\{n_{i}\right\}\right)\left|A_{j}\right|^{2} P\left(n_{1}, \ldots, n_{j}-1, \ldots, n_{k}+1, \ldots, n_{N-1}\right) \tag{12b}
\end{align*}
$$

where $P\left(\left\{n_{j}\right\}\right)$ is the initial value for the probability distribution function.
The expectation value for the photon numbers are given by

$$
\begin{align*}
\left\langle\hat{n}_{j}(t)\right\rangle_{\Delta}^{k}=\bar{n}_{j}+ & \sum_{\left\{n_{i}\right\}} P\left(\left\{n_{i}\right\}\right) \lambda_{j}^{2}\left(n_{j}+1\right) f_{j}^{2}\left(n_{1}, \ldots, n_{j}+1, n_{k}-1, \ldots, n_{N-1}\right) \\
& \times \lambda_{k}^{2} n_{k} f_{k}^{2}\left(\left\{n_{i}\right\}\right)\left|A_{k}\right|^{2} \quad(j \neq k) \tag{13a}
\end{align*}
$$

while

$$
\begin{equation*}
\left\langle\hat{n}_{k}(t)\right\rangle_{\Delta}^{k}=\bar{n}_{k}-\sum_{\left\{n_{j}\right\}} P\left(\left\{n_{j}\right\}\right) \lambda_{k}^{2} n_{k} f_{k}^{2}\left(\left\{n_{j}\right\}\right)\left(\frac{\sin ^{2}\left(\mu_{k} t\right)}{\mu_{k}^{2}}+\left(\nu_{k}-\lambda_{k}^{2} n_{k} f_{k}^{2}\left(\left\{n_{j}\right\}\right)\left|A_{k}\right|^{2}\right]\right) . \tag{13b}
\end{equation*}
$$

The expectation values for the occupation numbers are given in this case by

$$
\begin{align*}
& \left\langle\hat{S}_{j+1, j+1}(t)\right\rangle_{\Delta}^{k}=\left\langle\hat{n}_{j}(t)\right\rangle_{\Delta}^{k}-\bar{n}_{j} \quad \text { for } j \neq k  \tag{14a}\\
& \left\langle\hat{S}_{k+1, k+1}(t)\right\rangle_{\Delta}^{k}=\left\langle\hat{n}_{k}(t)\right\rangle_{\Delta}^{k}-\bar{n}_{k}+1 \tag{14b}
\end{align*}
$$

while we find

$$
\begin{equation*}
\left\langle\hat{S}_{11}(t)\right\rangle_{\Delta}^{k}=\sum_{\left\{n_{j}\right\}} P\left(\left\{n_{j}\right\}\right) \lambda_{k}^{2} n_{k} f_{k}^{2}\left(\left\{n_{j}\right\}\right) \frac{\sin ^{2}\left(\mu_{k} t\right)}{\mu_{k}^{2}} . \tag{14c}
\end{equation*}
$$

When $\Delta=0$ and $f=1$ we get the results of [29], while the results of the ' $\Lambda$ ' configuration for the three-level atom [25-27] are recovered when we write $N=3$ and $f=1$.
(b) Atom is initially in its upper state of energy $\omega_{1}$. In this case the initial density operator is given by

$$
\begin{equation*}
\hat{\rho}^{u}(0)=\hat{\rho}_{F}(0) \otimes \hat{S}_{11} \tag{15a}
\end{equation*}
$$

and the probability distribution function for the photons is

$$
\begin{align*}
P_{\Delta}^{u}\left(\left\{n_{j}\right\}, t\right)= & \left(\cos ^{2}(\mu t)+\frac{\Delta^{2}}{4 \mu^{2}} \sin ^{2}(\mu t)\right) P\left(\left\{n_{j}\right\}\right) \\
& +\sum_{k=1}^{N-1} \lambda_{k}^{2} n_{k} f_{k}^{2}\left(\left\{n_{j}\right\}\right) \frac{\sin ^{2}\left(\mu_{k} t\right)}{\mu_{k}^{2}} P\left(n_{1}, \ldots, n_{k}-1, \ldots, n_{N-1}\right) \tag{15b}
\end{align*}
$$

The photon number dependence on time is given by
$\left\langle\hat{n}_{j}(t)\right\rangle_{\Delta}^{u}=\bar{n}_{j}+\sum_{\left\{n_{i}\right\}} \lambda_{j}^{2}\left(n_{j}+1\right) f_{j}^{2}\left(n_{1}, \ldots, n_{j}+1, \ldots, n_{N-1}\right) \frac{\sin ^{2}(\mu t)}{\mu^{2}} P\left(\left\{n_{i}\right\}\right)$
while

$$
\begin{equation*}
\left\langle\hat{S}_{j+1, j+1}(t)\right\rangle_{\Delta}^{u}=\left\langle\hat{n}_{j}(t)\right\rangle_{\Delta}^{u}-\bar{n}_{j} \quad j \neq N \tag{16b}
\end{equation*}
$$

and

$$
\begin{equation*}
\left\langle S_{11}(t)\right\rangle_{\Delta}^{u}=\sum_{\left\{n_{i}\right\}}\left(\cos ^{2}(\mu t)+\frac{\Delta^{2}}{4 \mu^{2}} \sin ^{2}(\mu t)\right) P\left(\left\{n_{i}\right\}\right) . \tag{16c}
\end{equation*}
$$

It is apparent that the oscillations in these quantities depend on the Rabi frequency $2 \mu$. It is observed that the system develops in time in this case even when all modes start from vacuum.

We now look at the multiphoton processes. If we assume that the transition between the two levels $\omega_{1}$ and $\omega_{j+1}$ is effected through $m_{j}$ photons of the $j$ th mode, then the Hamiltonian is written as

$$
\begin{equation*}
H=\sum_{i=1}^{N} \omega_{i} \hat{S}_{i i}+\sum_{i=1}^{N-1} \Omega_{i} \hat{a}_{i}^{+} \hat{a}_{i}+\sum_{i=1}^{N-1} \lambda_{i}\left\{\hat{S}_{1, i+1} \hat{a}_{i}^{m_{i}}+\hat{a}^{+m} \hat{S}_{i+1,1}\right\} \tag{17}
\end{equation*}
$$

when we use the generalised boson operators $\hat{b}_{i}$ such that

$$
\begin{equation*}
\hat{a}_{i}^{m_{i}}=\hat{b}_{i}\left(\frac{\hat{n}_{i}!}{\left[\hat{n}_{i} / m_{i}\right]\left(\hat{n}_{i}-m_{i}\right)!}\right)^{1 / 2}=\hat{b}_{i} f_{i}\left(\hat{n}_{i}\right) \tag{18a}
\end{equation*}
$$

where the relation between $\hat{n}_{b_{1}}=\hat{b}_{i}^{+} \hat{b}_{i}$ and $\hat{n}_{i}=\hat{a}_{i}^{+} \hat{a}_{i}$ is given by [30]

$$
\begin{equation*}
\hat{n}_{i}=m_{i} \hat{n}_{b_{i}} \tag{18b}
\end{equation*}
$$

The Hamiltonian (19) now takes the form

$$
\begin{equation*}
H=\sum \omega_{i} \hat{S}_{i i}+\sum m_{i} \Omega_{i} \hat{b}_{i}^{+} \hat{b}_{i}+\sum \lambda_{i}\left\{\hat{S}_{1, i+1} \hat{b}_{i} f_{i}\left(\hat{n}_{i}\right)+f_{i}\left(\hat{n}_{i}\right) \hat{b}_{i}^{+} \hat{S}_{i+1, i}\right\} \tag{19}
\end{equation*}
$$

which is the same form as (1), but the function $f_{i}$ is a function of $n_{i}$ only and given by (18a). The $\nu$ of (9) are given by

$$
\begin{equation*}
\nu=\sum_{k} \lambda_{k}^{2} \frac{\left(n_{k}+m_{k}\right)!}{n_{k}!} \quad \nu_{j}=\lambda_{j}^{2}\left(\frac{n_{j}!}{\left(n_{j}-m_{j}\right)!}\right)+\sum_{k \neq j} \lambda_{k}^{2} \frac{\left(n_{k}+m_{k}\right)!}{n_{k}!} . \tag{20}
\end{equation*}
$$

For example, we find that $\left\langle\hat{n}_{j}(t)\right\rangle^{k}$ of (13a) is given by
$\left\langle\hat{n}_{j}(t)\right\rangle_{\text {multi }}^{k}=\bar{n}_{j}+\sum_{\left\{n_{i}\right\}} P\left(n_{1}, \ldots, n_{N-1}\right) \lambda_{j}^{2} \lambda_{k}^{2}\left(\frac{\left(n_{j}+m_{j}\right)!}{n_{j}!}\right)\left(\frac{n_{k}!}{\left(n_{k}-m_{k}\right)!}\right)\left|A_{k}\right|^{2} m_{j}$
where $A_{k}$ and $\mu_{k}$ are given by ( $9 d$ ) with $\nu_{k}$ given by (20).
We have presented a discussion of the model of an $N$-level atom and ( $N-1$ ) modes. Constants of motion are obtained. Under condition (5) the Hamiltonian becomes solvable. The photon number operators are computed when the atom is initially in one of its states. The occupation numbers in the levels are also given. The dependence on the detuning parameter $\Delta$ is shown.

## References

[1] Sargent M III, Scully M O and Lamb W E 1974 Laser Physics (Reading, MA: Addison Wesley)
[2] Haken H 1985 Light vol 2 (Amsterdam: North-Holland)
[3] Agrawal G S 1974 Quantum Optics (Tracts in Modern Physics 70) (Berlin: Springer)
[4] Allen L and Eberely J H 1975 Optical Resonance and the two-level atoms (New York: Wiley)
[5] Hassan S S and Bullough R K 1981 Optical Bistability ed C M Bowden et al (New York: Plenum) pp 367-404
[6] Zeldovich B Ya, Pilipesky N F and Shkunov V V 1985 Principles of Phase Conjugation (Berlin: Springer)
[7] Stenholm S 1984 Foundations of Laser Spectroscopy (New York: Wiley)
[8] Stenholm S 1985 Lasers in Applied and Fundamental Research ed S Stenholm (Bristol: Adam Hilger) pp 1-59
[9] Jaynes E T and Cummings F W 1963 Proc. IEE 5189
[10] Loudon R 1980 Rep. Prog. Phys. 43913
[11] Feneuille S 1977 Rep. Prog. Phys. 40 1257; 1985 Lasers in Applied and Fundamental Research ed S Stenholm (Bristol: Adam Hilger) pp 61-110
[12] Eberely J H, Narzhony N B and Sanchez-Mondragon J J 1980 Phys. Rev. Lett. 441323
[13] Narzhony N B, Sanchez-Mondragon J J and Eberely J H 1981 Phys. Rev. A 23236
[14] Yoo H I and Eberely J H 1985 Phys. Rep. 118239
[15] Knight P L and Radmore P M 1982 Phys. Rev. A 26676
[16] Singh S 1982 Phys. Rev. A 253206
[17] Milburn G J 1984 Optica Acta 31671
[18] Cagnac B, Grynberg G and Biraban F 1973 J. Physique 34845
[19] Levenson M D and Bloembergen N 1974 Phys. Rev. Lett. 341
[20] Pegg D T 1983 J. Phys. B: At. Mol. Phys. 16 2135; 1985 J. Phys. B: At. Mol. Phys. 18415
[21] Dalton B J and Knight P L 1982 J. Phys. B: At. Mol. Phys. 153997
[22] Chu S Y and Su D C 1982 Phys. Rev. A 202033
[23] Chobotayev V P 1976 High Resolution Laser Spectroscopy ed K Shimoda (Berlin: Springer) pp 207-50
[24] Buck B and Sukumar C V 1984 J. Phys. A: Math. Gen. 17877
[25] Li X-S and Bei N-Y 1984 Phys. Lett. 101A 169
[26] Bogolubov N N Jr, Kien F L and Shumovsky A S 1984 Phys. Lett. 101A 201; 1985 Phys. Lett. 107A 173, 456; 1986 J. Phys. A: Math. Gen. 20191
[27] Shumovsky A S, Aliskendrov E I and Kien F L 1985 J. Phys. A: Math. Gen. 19 L1031
[28] Dicke R H 1954 Phys. Rev. 9399
[29] Li X-S and Zhu S-Y 1985 Physica A 131575
[30] Katriel J and Hummer D G 1981 J. Phys. A: Math. Gen. 141211

